



Analysis of Integrated Quality Management Implementation Failure: A Systematic Literature Review in the Context of Education and Public Services

Yuvida Rahayu¹, Vica Ris Namira Putri Herdianto², Karunia Nafisah³, Mualimin⁴

^{1,2,3,4} Universitas Islam Negeri Kiai Haji Achmad Siddiq Jember, Indonesia

Email: yuvitarahayu68@gmail.com¹; vicarismira05@gmail.com²; karunianafisah88@gmail.com³; mualimin@gmail.com⁴

Abstract

Total Quality Management (TQM) has become an important approach to improving organizational performance through continuous improvement efforts. However, various studies show that its implementation often fails due to structural and cultural constraints within the organization. This makes a critical review of the causes of failure and success factors of TQM important to conduct as a basis for developing sustainable quality practices. This literature review article aims to analyze the factors causing the failure of TQM implementation and map related research trends, by answering two research questions: (1) What factors influence the success or failure of TQM implementation according to previous research? (2) What research gaps remain unanswered in TQM studies? The method used is a systematic literature review by searching articles through Google Scholar and DOAJ using the keywords TQM, TQM, quality implementation, and organizational quality. Of the 18 initial articles, 6 relevant articles were analyzed thematically. The review results indicate three main themes: the importance of leadership in quality management, the challenges of organizational culture to the success of TQM, and the impact of TQM implementation on organizational performance. Previous studies have been limited to descriptive studies and the context of education and public services. Therefore, future research needs to develop context-based MMT implementation models, strengthen empirical approaches, and integrate modern management innovations.

Keywords: *Quality Culture, Quality Implementation, Total Quality Management.*

PRELIMINARY

Planning in Total Quality Management (TQM) requires alignment between the institution's vision, strategic objectives, and sustainable quality system to achieve organizational effectiveness (Albab, 2021; Primasanti, 2021). In the context of Islamic education, the implementation of MMT is not only oriented towards academic quality, but also the formation of a quality culture based on spiritual values. The implementation of Integrated Quality Management (MMT) in education emphasizes the importance of systematic quality planning and the involvement of all organizational elements so that quality improvement is sustainable (Muhamad, 2020; Siregar, 2024). The urgency of implementing Total Quality Management (TQM) lies in its role as a strategic approach to improving organizational effectiveness by involving all elements in ensuring continuous quality. TQM emphasizes the importance of customer satisfaction, process improvement, and collaboration between leaders and members of the organization (Sarvitri & Supriyanto, 2020). However, in its development, MMT failure often occurs due to several factors, such as weak leadership commitment, resistance from human resources, lack of training, and inconsistent implementation of quality standards (Muttaqin, 2021; Rohmat & Yuslam, 2022). These failures show that the implementation of MMT is not just a procedural technicality, but requires a deep-rooted quality culture, visionary leadership, and ongoing support (Mastuti, 2020). The success of MMT implementation is influenced by professional quality system management and effective organizational communication support (Siregar, 2024; Tarakan, n.d.). Therefore, the urgency of periodic improvement

and evaluation in MMT is very important so that the organization not only avoids failure, but is also able to adapt to the dynamics of customer needs and developments of the times (Annisa, 2022).

Previous research on Total Quality Management (TQM) failures generally places the root causes at the feet of human and organizational factors such as weak leadership, resistance to change, and lack of managerial commitment as well as resource and training constraints; reviews and case studies have found that failures are often not due to techniques alone but to inadequate organizational culture and support (Ulfa & Shalahuddin, 2023; Yusuf & Sjamsir, 2021). The dominant methodological approaches include systematic and bibliometric reviews to map challenges and trends, qualitative case studies in specific sectors (education, health, manufacturing) to capture the dynamics of implementation (Fauzi, 2019), case studies of quality in schools and Islamic boarding schools (Aimah, 2021; Silvia, 2024), and quantitative surveys to examine the relationship between TQM practices and organizational performance. (Tjakrawala & Bangun, 2019). The main focus of research has also shifted: in addition to noting the classic causes of failure (leadership, culture, communication), the latest research highlights the “human side” aspects (motivation, skills, staff participation), the integration of TQM with digitalization/Industry 4.0, and the relationship of TQM with organizational agility in response to a rapidly changing environment. (Qomarudin et al., 2023). Practically, the literature shows a trend towards recommendations that emphasize the need for visionary leadership, ongoing training, clear outcome measurement, and a contextual approach (no “one recipe” for all sectors) as ways to prevent implementation failure.

The research gap regarding the failure of Total Quality Management (TQM) lies in the tendency of previous research to focus on classic factors such as leadership, organizational culture, and employee resistance, while studies linking this failure to new dynamics such as digitalization, organizational transformation, and the integration of quality with technology are still rare. Furthermore, most studies have been conducted in the manufacturing sector, while in-depth research in education and public services, which have different characteristics, is still minimal. (Tjiphanata & Tumewu, 2024). Research approaches are also generally descriptive or partial case studies, thus lacking a longitudinal picture of the dynamics of MMT failure and its long-term sustainability. Furthermore, many proposed failure prevention strategies remain normative and lack support from empirical models tested across sectors. Therefore, there is a research gap for developing more contextual, adaptive, and empirically evidence-based studies to more comprehensively understand and anticipate MMT failures.

Total Quality Management (TQM) is a systemic approach that emphasizes the involvement of all organizational components in continuous quality improvement efforts. According to (Primasanti, 2021), TQM is based on the principle that quality is not solely the responsibility of a specific department but rather a shared commitment of all organizational members to achieve internal and external customer satisfaction. This approach emphasizes the importance of integrating quality planning, implementation, and evaluation to ensure effective and efficient organizational processes (Albab, 2021).

In the context of Islamic education, MMT is not only aimed at improving academic quality but also at strengthening students' spiritual and moral values. (Muhamad, 2020) stated that the implementation of MMT in Islamic educational institutions must integrate managerial dimensions and Islamic ethics, so that quality is measured not only by learning outcomes but also by character and moral development. (Siregar, 2024) added that the success of MMT development in Islamic education depends on transformational leadership, active teacher participation, and a consistent collaborative work culture.

Furthermore, the effectiveness of MMT implementation is also significantly influenced by communication and change management. (HM, 2019) emphasized that open and participatory communication can strengthen coordination between work units, prevent resistance, and foster commitment to quality. In the public services sector, (Tarakan, n.d.) demonstrated that the implementation of ISO 9001:2000-based quality standards in community health centers demonstrates that MMT principles can be applied across sectors, provided they are supported by clear quality planning and leadership that adapts to changes in the organizational environment.

Conceptually, MMT requires synergy between strategic planning, human resource development, effective communication, and ongoing evaluation as part of a continuous quality improvement cycle. Thus, MMT can be viewed as a management paradigm that focuses not only on results but also on the processes, values, and organizational culture that support sustainable quality.

METHOD

This research employed a qualitative approach using the Literature Review (LR) method (Assingkily, 2021). This method was chosen because it provides an in-depth understanding of the research topic through the search and analysis of relevant scientific works. This article was compiled following literature review guidelines that emphasize transparency and replication, ensuring that each step in the search, selection, and analysis of articles can be traced and re-examined by other researchers.

The literature search strategy utilized the Google Scholar database and the Publish or Perish (PoP) application. The data collected consisted of scientific articles from journals with a current publication period of six years (2019–2025). The search was conducted by entering the keyword "integrated quality management failure," resulting in 19 articles. A screening process was then conducted to eliminate articles containing similar or duplicate topic ideas from different sources. After the elimination phase, 12 articles remained relevant to the research focus. These articles were then further selected based on topic suitability and year of publication, resulting in a final selection of six articles, which served as the primary sources for the analysis. The collected data was then validated and coded based on definitions consistent with the research objectives. Furthermore, the articles were grouped into a theme table to facilitate the analysis and synthesis of the research findings.

Table 1. Article Review Table

No	Authors	Title	Research Method	Context	Key Findings
1	Sarvitri, A dan Supriyanto, A (2020)	<i>Penerapan manajemen mutu terpadu pada sistem penjaminan mutu pendidikan internal</i>	Qualitative, case study	Education (internal quality assurance system)	The implementation of MMT supports improving the quality of education, but challenges arise in the consistency of implementing quality standards.
2	Aimah, S (2021)	<i>Manajemen mutu terpadu di pesantren</i>	Qualitative, descriptive	Pesantren	MMT in Islamic boarding schools strengthens a culture of quality based on religious values, but is still hampered by modern managerial aspects.
3	Mastuti, NP (2020)	<i>Implementasi Manajemen Mutu Terpadu (MMT) Terhadap Kinerja Guru di MTs Al-Ittibadiyah Rumbai Pekanbaru</i>	Qualitative	Madrasah Tsanawiyah	MMT has a positive influence on improving teacher performance, especially in terms of discipline and teaching quality.
4	Tjakrawala, K & Bangun, N (2019)	<i>Aspek kepemimpinan manajemen, praktik manajemen mutu terpadu, dan quality performance</i>	Quantitative, survei	Business/accounting	Leadership has a significant influence on MMT practices, and both have an impact on improving the quality of organizational performance.
5	Rohmat, R & Yuslam, Y	<i>Implementasi Manajemen Mutu</i>	Qualitative	Basic education (MI)	The implementation of MMT in madrasah

	(2022)	<i>Terpadu di Madrasah Ibtidaiyah</i>			improves the quality of educational services, but requires adequate human resource support and facilities.
6	Tjiphanata, R & Tumewu, FJ (2024)	<i>Analisis penerapan manajemen mutu terpadu di rumah sakit umum daerah maria walanda maramis</i>	Case study	Hospital	MMT in hospitals helps improve healthcare services, but faces challenges in terms of leadership and engagement of all staff.

Table 1 shows that the six reviewed articles cover various contexts of Integrated Quality Management (IQM) implementation using diverse methodological approaches. Research by Sarvitri and Supriyanto (2020) and Rohmat and Yuslam (2022) used qualitative methods to examine the implementation of IQM in formal education, demonstrating that while IQM supports improving educational quality, the main challenges lie in consistent implementation of quality standards and limited human resources. Aimah (2021) explored the implementation of IQM in Islamic boarding schools (pesantren), which successfully strengthened a culture of quality based on religious values but was still hampered by modern managerial aspects. Meanwhile, Mastuti (2020) demonstrated the positive influence of IQM on teacher performance in Islamic junior high schools (madrasah tsanawiyah), while Tjakrawala and Bangun (2019) used a quantitative approach to demonstrate the significant role of leadership in IQM practices and improving organizational performance. Tjiphanata and Tumewu (2024) found, in a case study of a hospital, that IQM contributed to improving healthcare services but faced challenges in leadership and staff engagement. Overall, these six articles provide a comprehensive picture that the success of MMT is highly dependent on leadership commitment, organizational quality culture, and the active participation of all elements in the organization.

FINDINGS AND DISCUSSION

Of the 18 initial articles identified in the reference list related to the topic of Total Quality Management (TQM), a screening process was conducted based on topic relevance, recency, and appropriateness to the research context. After an initial assessment, six articles were selected for in-depth analysis. These six articles cover research from various contexts, such as formal education, Islamic boarding schools (pesantren), health institutions, and business organizations, thus providing a comprehensive overview of TQM implementation in various fields.

The review results show that the first dominant theme is the success factors and challenges of MMT implementation. Study (Sarvitri & Supriyanto, 2020) as well as (Rohmat & Yuslam, 2022) emphasized that MMT can gradually improve the quality of organizational services if supported by management commitment and continuous quality evaluation. However, both noted that limited human resources, weak commitment to implementation, and a lack of consistent quality standards are key obstacles, often resulting in MMT implementation being administrative in nature and failing to substantially improve quality.

The second theme that emerged was the role of leadership in the effectiveness of MMT. Study (Tjakrawala & Bangun, 2019) dan (Ulfa & Shalahuddin, 2023) shows that transformational leadership plays a crucial role in supporting the effectiveness of MMT through the creation of a quality culture and empowerment of human resources. Without strong support from institutional leaders, MMT implementation becomes merely a formality without significantly impacting organizational performance. Research in MTs and SMK shows that the principal, as a leader, plays a crucial role in quality control, communicating the quality vision, and improving teacher performance motivation.

The third theme relates to the impact of MMT implementation on organizational performance. (Mastuti, 2020) and (Tjiphanata & Tumewu, 2024) found that the implementation of MMT has a positive

relationship with improved service quality, both in education and healthcare. In the education sector, MMT improves teacher performance and the quality of the learning process through a standardized work culture. Meanwhile, in hospitals, MMT improves service quality and patient safety. However, both studies also emphasize that MMT implementation requires the involvement of all members of the organization and cannot rely solely on structural policies.

Overall, the literature review indicates that MMT has the potential to be an effective strategy for improving organizational quality. However, its successful implementation is heavily influenced by leadership, quality culture, human resource readiness, and continuous quality evaluation. While numerous studies have demonstrated the benefits of MMT, more contextual research is needed, particularly linking MMT to modern management innovation and the digitalization of organizational services.

CONCLUSION

Based on the results of the literature review, it can be concluded that Total Quality Management (TQM) is essentially a strategic approach capable of improving organizational quality through continuous improvement, but the effectiveness of its implementation is greatly influenced by organizational factors such as leadership, quality culture, and human resource readiness. Answering the first research question, the most consistent factors found in previous studies as causes of TQM success or failure are leadership commitment, participation of all organizational members, a continuous quality evaluation system, and consistent application of quality standards. Meanwhile, answering the second research question, previous studies tend to focus on the technical aspects of TQM implementation and do not explore the contextual challenges in educational institutions and the public sector, especially related to management innovation and adaptation to changes in the organizational environment.

The primary contribution of this literature review is to provide a comprehensive synthesis of research trends in context-based quality management (MMT) and to identify understudied research areas, particularly concerning MMT implementation failures and strategic efforts to address them in the educational context. These findings are useful for academics as a foundation for theory development and further research on context-based quality management, and open up opportunities for the development of new conceptual models. For practitioners, this synthesis provides important insights into the prerequisites for successful MMT: that MMT requires not only formal procedures but also leadership commitment, a culture of quality, and the systemic involvement of all organizational elements to produce sustainable quality change.

REFERENCES

- Aimah, S. (2021). Manajemen mutu terpadu di pesantren. *LISAN AL-HAL: Jurnal Pengembangan Pemikiran Dan Kebudayaan*, 15(2), 195–226.
- Albab, U. (2021). Perencanaan pendidikan dalam manajemen mutu terpadu pendidikan islam. *Jurnal Pancar (Pendidik Anak Cerdas Dan Pintar)*, 5(1), 119–126.
- Annisa. (2022). *Manajemen Mutu Terpadu Dan Implementasinya Dalam Pendidikan Di SMA Negeri 4 Palopo*. Institut Agama Islam Negeri (IAIN) Palopo.
- Assingkily, M. S. (2021). *Metode Penelitian Pendidikan: Panduan Menulis Artikel Ilmiah dan Tugas Akhir*. Yogyakarta: K-Media.
- Fauzi, H. N. (2019). Manajemen Mutu Terpadu dalam Meningkatkan Kinerja Sekolah SMK Ma'arif 1 Piyungan Bantul. *Dirasat: Jurnal Manajemen Dan Pendidikan Islam*, 5(2), 134–147.
- HM, B. W. (2019). Manajemen Mutu Terpadu Dalam Komunikasi. *Medikom | Jurnal Ilmu Pendidikan Dan Dakwah*, 1(1), 66–76.
- Mastuti, N. P. (2020). Implementasi Manajemen Mutu Terpadu (MMT) Terhadap Kinerja Guru di MTs Al-Ittihadiyah Rumbai Pekanbaru. *Al-Afkar: Manajemen Pendidikan Islam*, 8(1), 4–84.
- Muhamad, R. S. (2020). *Konsep Implementasi Manajemen Mutu Terpadu di Lembaga Pendidikan Islam*.
- Muttaqin, M. (2021). *Implementasi Manajemen Mutu Terpadu Di SMK Albikmah 2 Sirampog Brebes*. Institut Agama Islam Negeri Purwokerto (Indonesia).
- Primasanti, Y. (2021). *Manajemen Mutu Terpadu*. Penerbit Dwijo.
- Qomarudin, A., Fitriyah, H., & Hermawan, S. (2023). Implementasi Keberhasilan Sistem Manajemen Mutu Terpadu Hazard Analysis and Critical Control Point Melalui Peningkatan Kompetensi

- Sumber Daya Manusia. *Jurnal Bisnis Dan Manajemen*, 10(1), 37–44.
- Rohmat, R., & Yuslam, Y. (2022). Implementasi Manajemen Mutu Terpadu di Madrasah Ibtidaiyah. *Jurnal Kependidikan*, 10(1), 1–19.
- Sarvitri, A., & Supriyanto, A. (2020). Penerapan manajemen mutu terpadu pada sistem penjaminan mutu pendidikan internal. *JAMP: Jurnal Administrasi Dan Manajemen Pendidikan*, 3(1), 38–51.
- Silvia, A. (2024). *Implementasi Manajemen Mutu Terpadu Di SMA Al-Azhar 3 Bandar Lampung*. UIN RADEN INTAN LAMPUNG.
- Siregar, A. S. (2024). Pengembangan Manajemen Mutu Terpadu di Lembaga Pendidikan Islam. *Innovative: Journal Of Social Science Research*, 4(3), 8610–8626.
- Tarakan, K. (n.d.). *Analisa Faktor-Faktor Manajemen Mutu Terpadu Pada Puskesmas Yang Memperoleh ISO-9001: 2000 DI*.
- Tjakrawala, K., & Bangun, N. (2019). Aspek kepemimpinan manajemen, praktik manajemen mutu terpadu, dan quality performance. *Jurnal Dinamika Akuntansi Dan Bisnis*, 6(1), 85–102.
- Tjiphanata, R., & Tumewu, F. J. (2024). Analisis penerapan manajemen mutu terpadu di rumah sakit umum daerah maria walanda maramis. *Jurnal EMBA: Jurnal Riset Ekonomi, Manajemen, Bisnis Dan Akuntansi*, 12(01), 521–531.
- Ulfa, M., & Shalahuddin, S. (2023). Upaya Kepala Sekolah Meningkatkan Kinerja Sebagai Leader dalam Manajemen Mutu Terpadu. *Al-Rabwah*, 17(02), 98–107.
- Yusuf, M., & Sjamsir, H. (2021). Manajemen Mutu Terpadu Di SMK Negeri 7 Samarinda. *BEduManagers Journal: Borneo Educational Management and Research Journal*, 2(1), 22–32.